the motivation for conservation

protection from neglect and decay, economic pressures, and in principle war

more recently also terrorism and ideological vandalism, nationalism, and tourism
PROBLEMS

over-restoration
loss of authenticity
inappropriate technology
functional alteration
moving of buildings
destruction of environment
Up to the Athens Charter

pioneer moves for conservation
1818 Grand Duke Ludwig of Hesse issues 400 word decree
1819 Cardinal Pacca issued an edict for the papal states
1853 Commission des Monuments Historiques established in France

romantic interpretation - Viollet-le-Duc

conservative restoration – the British school

international agreements
1931 International Museum Office organised Athens Conference on the Restoration of Historic Buildings
1932 Assembly of the League of Nations adopts Athens Charter
Eugène-Emmanuel Viollet-le-Duc (1866)

Restaurer un édifice, ce n'est pas l'entretenir, le réparer ou le refaire, c'est le rétablir dans un état complet qui peut n'avoir jamais existé à un moment donné

To restore a building is not to maintain, repair or reconstruct it. It is to re-establish it in a condition that may never have existed at any one time

La Sainte Chapelle, Paris, by Pierre de Montreuil, 1243-8, view from the south-west

La Goélette
La Sainte Chapelle: crypt chapel, restored by Viollet-le-Duc
La Goélette
La Sainte Chapelle

east end of the crypt chapel, restored by Viollet-le-Duc

La Goélette
As a general rule, it is highly desirable to preserve those vestiges of the growth and history of the building which are indicated by the various styles and irregularities of its parts; they often add interest to a church in other respects poor; they frequently add materially to its picturesque character; and nearly always render it more valuable as a study. .... In some cases the *later* are the more valuable and beautiful features; but in these the architect of true feeling will be unwilling to obliterate earlier features, however simple or even rude, to bring them into uniformity with more ornamental additions. ... In other cases, some one of the *earlier* styles claims the finest and most beautiful features; but it by no means follows that the later parts should be removed, even though they may infringe upon finer forms: in some instances, however, this may seem to be desirable ... It may, however, be assumed as a rule that an authentic feature, though late and poor, is more worthy than an earlier though finer part conjecturally restored ...

Above all, I would urge that individual caprice should be wholly excluded from restorations. Let not the restorer give undue preference to the remains of any one age, to the prejudice of another, merely because the one is, and the other is not, his own favourite style.

Warsaw, Poland

in 1939 showing the results of bombing

as reconstructed, 1948

from Philip Goad 2003
the Venice Charter & ICOMOS

post-war reconstruction of Warsaw, Amsterdam &c.


1957 international congress of architects and specialists in historic buildings

1964 another ditto produces the Venice Charter

1965 International Council on Monuments and Sites [ICOMOS] founded at Warsaw
Venice Charter 1964

'historic monument'
contributions of all periods
'ananstlylosis'
reconstruction banned
the International Council on Monuments and Sites

ICOMOS founded at Warsaw, 1965
Australian issues
Vth General Assembly, Moscow, 1978

Burra Charter, Australia, 1981
Australia ICOMOS & the *Burra Charter*

1959 the gold line in the Como Ballroom

?c 1974 Enquiry into the National Estate Judge Hope

c1975 Interim Committee on the National Estate Judge Hope

C1975 Australian Heritage Commission David Yencken

C 1976 Australia ICOMOS founded

1978 Vth General Assembly of ICOMOS, Moscow
problems with vernacular & perishable architecture, townscape, industrial sites, recent buildings cf 'Monuments'

1979 committee set up to adapt the Venice Charter

1980 Department of Housing & Construction adopted the *Burra Charter* for projects on Norfolk Island

1983 UNESCO conference, Sydney
issues & ideas

Venice & Burra principles
the statement of significance
anastylosis
moving buildings
Motts & Mills
reconstruction of depleted entities
(or ensembles - US Nat Parks)
places
visual boundaries
perception
the townscape tradition
building life and recycling
the statement of significance

historical
aesthetic
scientific
social
spiritual
anastylosis in classical buildings

Olympeion, Athens
Temple of Athena Polias, Priene
Nereid Monument from Xanthos
Hellenistic Temple at Garni, Armenia
Olympeion, Athens: fallen column
Miles Lewis
Temple of Athena Polias, Priene, Turkey

Miles Lewis
Nereid Monument from Xanthos, British Museum

Miles Lewis
Nereid Monument: detail

Miles Lewis
temple at Garni, Armenia

Miles Lewis
plinth of the temple at Garni
Miles Lewis
anastylosis in the entablature at Garni

Miles Lewis
anastylosis above the doorway at Garni

Miles Lewis
the application of anastylosis

decoration - Versailles

carpentry - Bokrijk

collapsed structure - French Island

decayed structure - Gulf Station

the dating of new components
Château de Versailles: anastylosis in decoration

J M Pérouse de Montclos, Versailles (New York 1991), p 308
Bokrijk Museum, Belgium: anastylosis in carpentry

Marc Laenen
Gardiner’s House, French Island, in its collapsed state

Miles Lewis
Gardiner’s farmhouse: wattle-and-daub panel
Gardiner’s house during jacking

Miles Lewis
Gardiner’s house, after jacking
Miles Lewis
Gardiner’s house: survey drawing in its collapsed state
Gardiner’s house: reconstruction drawing
milking shed, Gulf Station, Yarra Glen

Miles Lewis
Gulf Station: collapsed cow bails

Miles Lewis
interior of milking shed, Gulf Station, Yarra Glen
Helen Watters
Gulf Station: detail of collapsed milking bails
Helen Watters
Gulf Station post showing hitching peg and rotting base

Helen Watters
Gulf Station: cutting the bottom off the post

Miles Lewis
Gulf Station: new base for post
Helen Watters
Gulf Station
restored post with new spliced base
Miles Lewis
ball court, Monte Alban, Oaxaca, Mexico, c AD 300-700

Miles Lewis
ball court, Monte Alban, pebbled joints indicating restoration work

Miles Lewis
Gulf Station: new post with date
Miles Lewis
Gulf Station: metal punch for dating

Miles Lewis
the moving of buildings

minaret, Abou Houreira, Syria
minaret, Meskine, Syria
church, Czechoslovakia
temples of Abu Simbel, Egypt
minaret at Abou Hereira, Syria, being dismantled

*Monumentum, XVII (1978), p 65*
minaret at Meskineh, Syria: drum cut off for removal

Miles Lewis
minaret at Meskineh: drums being moved

Miles Lewis
reconstructed minaret from Meskineh

*Monumentum*, XVII (1978), p 66
computerised transfer buggy, Czechoslovakia

*Monumentum, XVII (1978), p 78*
moving a church, Czechoslovakia

*Monumentum, XVII* (1978), p. 66
Temples of Ramesses II & Hathor, Abu Simbel, ?c 1260 BC, before the construction of the Aswan Dam

Monumentum, XVII (1978), p 28
cutting up a temple façade,
Abu Simbel

Monumentum,
XVII (1978), p 3
dismantling the Temple of Ramesses II, Abu Simbel

the temples of Abu Simbel in their new location

Dino Sassi, photographer, *Egypt in Colours* series, Abu Simbel no 28, © Al Ahram
Temples of Ramesses II and Hathor, Abu Simbel

Miles Lewis
Temple of Hathor, Abu Simbel, upper façade, showing the saw cuts

Miles Lewis
Temple of Hathor, Abu Simbel, anastylosis

Miles Lewis
Temple of Ramesses II, Abu Simbel, façade

Miles Lewis
Temple of Ramesses II, Abu Simbel, interior

Miles Lewis
Temple of Ramesses II, Abu Simbel
plan as re-erected with concrete surround

Monumentum, XVII (1978)
the contributions of all periods
Alahan Manastir, Turkey
Alahan Manastir: plan
Alahan Manastir: east church
Miles Lewis
Alahan Manastir: west church
Miles Lewis
Alahan Manastir: the original cave

Miles Lewis
Motts & Mills Cottages
the role of the intelligent viewer
Mott’s Cottage, 5
Sackville St, Port Fairy

1975 & 1979

Miles Lewis
the Mills Cottage, 40, Gipps Street, Port Fairy

Miles Lewis
the Mills Cottage, 40 Gipps Street, Port Fairy

kitchen finishes exposed traces of a window frame

exposing wallpapers

peeling back the calico lining

Miles Lewis
Australian practice

historic structure reports & conservation analyses

Werribee Park

the National Trust

citations and cultural significance
the conservation analysis
the conservation plan
improvement & amenity

Maldon mining landscape
Drummond Street planting
St James’s Park
Churchill Island
other aspects

farmscape

Drummond Street planting

St James’s Park

Churchill Island

plant growth [Como, State Library, Kew Asylum]
introduction

• over-restoration
• loss of authenticity
• inappropriate technology
• functional alteration
• moving of buildings
• destruction of environment
early history of conservation

• the early nineteenth century
• France - Viollet-le-Duc
• Britain - Scott, Ruskin, Morris, SPAB
• War - the Hague Convention
• the Athens Charter
• Montecassino, Warsaw &c
the Venice Charter

• 1954 UNESCO Convention
• 1964 Venice Charter
• ‘historic monument’
• contributions of all periods
• ‘anastylosis’
• reconstruction banned
ICOMOS

- 1965 foundation at Warsaw
- 1978 Vth General Assembly, Moscow
- 1981 *Burra Charter*, Australia
the Statement of Significance

- historical
- aesthetic
- scientific
- social
- spiritual
CONCLUSION

• European bias v. local application
• authenticity v. fabrication
• history v. propaganda
• scholarship v. prejudice
• information v. titillation
• inspiration v. cliché
types of cultural significance
æsthetic, historic, scientific, social & spiritual significance

æsthetic - fine, according to who?
the typical & the exceptional

historic - with a meaningful historical connection

social - eg value as housing? community identity?

scientific - economic or other potential, or simply knowledge?

spiritual – should it be a category at all?